

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	iv
AUTHOR BIOS	vii
INTRODUCTION	1
Outline of the Book.	4
What This Book Does Not Discuss	8
<i>EPA/Tribal Relations</i>	9
<i>Criminal and Citizen Enforcement</i>	10
Introduction Endnotes	11
CHAPTER ONE:	
AN OVERVIEW OF ENVIRONMENTAL FEDERALISM	13
Introduction	13
The Emergence of the “Federal Regulatory Infrastructure” and Its Predominant “Cooperative Federalism” Model	14
Trends in Location of Responsibility	17
Issues Relating to the Centralization and Decentralization of Power and Responsibility	21
<i>Arguments Supporting Centralization</i>	22
<i>Benefits of Decentralization</i>	32
<i>Conclusions.</i>	35
Major Constitutional Doctrines With the Potential to Affect Federalism.	36
<i>The “Active” Commerce Clause</i>	37
<i>The “Dormant” Commerce Clause</i>	40
<i>Tenth Amendment Limits on the Power of the Federal Government to Require State Action</i>	41
<i>The Supremacy Clause and “Preemption”.</i>	42
Conclusion	43
Chapter One Endnotes	45

**REINVENTING ENVIRONMENTAL ENFORCEMENT AND THE
STATE/FEDERAL RELATIONSHIP**

CHAPTER TWO:

STRATEGIES FOR ACHIEVING COMPLIANCE WITH
ENVIRONMENTAL LAWS 59

Deterrence-Based Enforcement 60

The Underlying Theory. 60

Deterrence-Based Enforcement in Practice 61

Cooperation-Based Enforcement 67

The Underlying Theory. 67

Cooperation-Based Enforcement in Practice 70

Environmental Enforcement as a Hybrid 81

Conclusion 83

Chapter Two Endnotes 84

CHAPTER THREE:

THE STATE/EPA ENFORCEMENT RELATIONSHIP 91

A Brief History and Overview 91

Conditions for State “Authorization” 93

**EPA Oversight of State Enforcement and
Compliance Activities**. 98

*Oversight Criteria and Measures: Defining Good
Performance* 99

Oversight Procedures and Protocols 104

*Criteria for Direct Federal Enforcement in
Delegated States*. 105

*Advance Notification and Consultation—
“No Surprises”* 115

State Reporting 115

The Framework in Practice: Regional Variation. . . 116

The RPF in Practice: A Look at New York 119

Conclusion 123

Chapter Three Endnotes 125

CHAPTER FOUR:

THE “REINVENTED” ENFORCEMENT RELATIONSHIP. 139

Background: The Push for Devolution 141

**The State Approach to Environmental
Enforcement** 146

TABLE OF CONTENTS

<i>Enhanced Compliance Assistance</i>	147
<i>Fewer Inspections, Enforcement Actions, and Penalties.</i>	149
<i>Audit Privilege and Immunity Laws.</i>	156
EPA’s Evolving Approach to Enforcement	160
<i>Expanded Compliance Assistance Programs</i>	161
<i>Compliance Incentives</i>	163
<i>Fine-Tuning Traditional Enforcement</i>	167
EPA’s Oversight of the States: Transition and Mixed Messages	168
<i>The Move Toward Greater State Flexibility: NEPPS.</i>	169
<i>EPA’s Continued Insistence on Deterrence-Based Policies</i>	173
<i>The Impact of NEPPS on the EPA/State Enforcement Relationship.</i>	187
Conclusion	191
Chapter Four Endnotes	192

CHAPTER FIVE:

DETERRENCE VERSUS COOPERATION: IS MAJOR REFORM APPROPRIATE?	213
The Theoretical Arguments for Rejecting Deterrence-Based Models in Favor of Cooperative Approaches.	214
<i>Compliance Because of Adherence to Social Norms</i>	214
<i>Compliance Because of Market Forces</i>	218
<i>Self-Regulatory Systems.</i>	225
<i>Deterrence Is Counterproductive</i>	230
<i>The Deterrence Model Is Inefficient</i>	232
The Expressive Function of Deterrence-Based Enforcement	235
Empirical Evidence	237
<i>Research on Cooperative Strategies</i>	237
<i>Research on Deterrence-Based Approaches</i>	244

REINVENTING ENVIRONMENTAL ENFORCEMENT AND THE
STATE/FEDERAL RELATIONSHIP

Summary 251

**The Proper Balance of Deterrence and Cooperative
Enforcement Strategies** 251

Fine-Tuning Deterrence-Based Tools 252

Incentives for EMS 261

*Publicly Spotlighting the Compliance Status of
Regulated Firms.* 262

Conclusion 267

Chapter Five Endnotes 268

CHAPTER SIX:

ENHANCING STATE PERFORMANCE:

OPTIONS FOR EPA 289

**EPA Should Play a Stricter Gatekeeper Role in
Authorizing State Programs** 291

**EPA Needs to Deliver a Clearer Message About Its
Expectations** 295

**EPA Should Revise Its Criteria for Evaluating the
Efficacy of State Enforcement and Compliance
Programs** 296

Environmental Indicators 298

Rates of Compliance and Other Outcome Data . . . 302

Agency Enforcement Activities 306

Agency “Inputs”—Spending and Staffing 311

Better Methods of Program Evaluation 312

**EPA and the States Should Improve Their Data
Management Systems** 317

**EPA Should Implement a Formal System of
Differential Oversight Based on State
Performance** 319

**EPA Evaluation of State Performance Should Be
Publicly Disclosed** 322

**EPA Should Maintain Withdrawal of State Program
Authorizations as a Credible Option** 329

**EPA Should Enhance Enforcement in Authorized
States** 335

TABLE OF CONTENTS

*EPA Should Take Steps to Enhance the Capacity of
State Programs* 336
*EPA Should Divide the Enforcement/Compliance
Universe More Systematically With States* 336
EPA Should Continue to Overfile Strategically 339
Conclusion 342
Chapter Six Endnotes 344

CONCLUSION 361
Conclusion Endnotes 370

APPENDICES:

Revised Policy Framework for State/EPA Enforcement
Agreements [GM-411] (1986) 374
Revisions to the Policy Framework for State/EPA
Enforcement Agreements (1993) 423
Uniform Enforcement Oversight System (UEOS)
Evaluation Criteria for Fiscal Year 2002 437
FACT SHEET: EPA Region 8 Uniform Enforcement
Oversight System (UEOS): Improvements for Fiscal
Year 2002 441
Uniform Enforcement Oversight System (Form A) 443